## **WORKSHOP**

## Women Fish Vendors In Mumbai

## Report

2-3 December 2012 Tata Institute of Social Sciences (TISS), Mumbai, India



International Collective in Support of Fishworkers www.icsf.net

Workshop Women Fish Vendors in Mumbai

2 – 3 December 2012

Report March 2013

## Published by

Chandrika Sharma for International Collective in Support of Fishworkers (ICSF) 27 College Road, Chennai 600 006, India Email: icsf@icsf.net Website: http://www.icsf.net

#### Edited by KG Kumar

Designed by P. Sivasakthivel

Copyright © ICSF 2013

ISBN 978-93-80802-10-7

While ICSF reserves all rights for this publication, any portion of it may be freely copied and distributed, provided appropriate credit is given. Any commercial use of this material is prohibited without prior permission. ICSF would appreciate receiving a copy of any publication that uses this publication as a source.

The opinions and positions expressed in this publication are those of the authors concerned and do not necessarily represent the official views of ICSF.

3

## **Acronyms and Abbreviations**

BMC Brihanmumbai Municipal Corporation

CIFE Central Institute of Fisheries Education

FSI floor space index

ICSF International Collective in Support of Fishworkers

MMKS Maharashtra Macchimar Kruti Samittee

MMRDA Mumbai Metropolitan Region Development Authority

NHF National Hawkers Federation

NFDB National Fisheries Development Board

PPP public-private partnership

SHG self help group

SRA Slum Redevelopment Authority

TISS Tata Institute of Social Sciences

TVC Town Vending Committee

<sup>\*</sup> Currency exchange rate: 1 USD = 54.42 Rs

## Introduction

## **Background**

ccording to the Marine Fisheries Census 2010, brought out by India's Ministry of Agriculture, the State of Maharashtra has 45,971 people from fishing communities engaged in fish marketing. Of these, 36,668 (79 per cent) are women. The situation is similar in other coastal States of India. Women of fishing communities are known to dominate marketing and processing activities, reflecting a gender-based division of labour, where women tend to be predominant in land-based activities, such as net weaving, processing and marketing fish, while men engage in fish harvesting.

The International Collective in Support of Fishworkers (ICSF) undertook a study titled "Women Fish Vendors in Mumbai" to document the current situation and challenges women fish vendors Mumbai. A workshop was organized at the Tata Institute of Social Sciences (TISS), Mumbai, during 2-3 December 2012 to discuss the study, articulate proposals and suggest strategies to secure the livelihoods of women fish vendors in Mumbai.

The ICSF study focused on women fish vendors in formal markets owned the Brihanmumbai Municipal Corporation (BMC) and private markets, as well as unstructured markets (street, peripatetic vendors). At a very general level, the study found that, irrespective of the fact that vending has been a traditional occupation for women of fishing communities in Mumbai, they are increasingly marginalized from their livelihoods due to factors such as the private development of markets, poor maintenance and deteriorating conditions of markets, lack of licences for legitimate vendors, scarcity of fish,

increased competition from malls and non-traditional vendors, and absence of decent working conditions and social-security measures. It was also found that though Maharashtra has a large number of women fish vendors, for the most part, women vendor organizations are not strong. Also, the Fisheries Department of Maharashtra has no women-vendor-specific schemes, reflecting the gender bias inherent in much of fisheries policy.

### **Objectives**

The aim of the workshop was to analyze issues facing women fish vendors in Mumbai and to discuss, based on their proposals, strategies that may be adopted to secure their livelihoods.

### **Participants**

A one-day preparatory workshop was organized on 2 December 2012 in which representatives of fishworker unions and vendor and market associations (from Mumbai and other parts of India), researchers and activists participated to discuss the study and to make specific proposals.

The main workshop, on brought December. together representatives of the Maharashtra Fisheries Department, **BMC** fishworker organizations, as well as researchers and activists to discuss the proposals from the study as well as strategies that could be adopted for securing the livelihoods of women vendors.

The participants at the workshop had varied backgrounds, educational qualifications and levels of exposure to such processes, which contributed to making it a very rich environment for mutual sharing and learning. §

# Report of the Workshop Day 1: 2 December 2012

he focus of the first day was on elucidation of demands and identification of proposals for action, from representatives of fish vendor associations in Mumbai. The 31 participants included representatives from the Maharashtra Macchimar Kruti Samittee (MMKS), Mumbai-based market associations, representatives the National Hawkers from Federation (NHF) various from States, representatives from YUVA (a non-governmental organization), fishworker leaders, as well researchers from TISS.

The day began with a brief introduction to the workshop and the day's programme by Chandrika Sharma, Executive Secretary of ICSF. Thanking all present for taking the time to attend the workshop, she requested the participants to introduce themselves.

Following this, Sharma spoke of the status of women in fisheries in India and in the State of Maharashtra. Noting the vulnerability of fishing communities, and, particularly, women within these communities, she said that, according to a recent marine fisheries census, of the total marine fisherfolk population of four mn, a majority (61 per cent) are below the poverty line. Sharma's presentation also spoke of the predominance of women marketing—nearly 81.8 per of those in marketing are women. Similarly, women dominate curing and processing (88.1 per cent), and peeling (89.6 per cent). Despite this, she noted, little has been done to improve the lot of women in fisheries.

## Problems faced by fish vendors in Mumbai: An overview

Ujjwala Patil of MMKS spoke of how she began working with women vendors. Some work had earlier been undertaken to organize women vendors in Thane, which had led to the reservation of a compartment in local trains for women fish vendors. Very little attention had, however, been paid to their livelihood problems. Patil quoted the example of the recent Chitra Khalija oil spill incident off the Mumbai coast in August 2010. Following the spill, people had been advised not to eat fish for fear of contamination. Women vendors were not allowed to sell fish in any of the fish markets in Mumbai. This was despite the fact that the oil spill happened during the fishing ban period in Maharashtra, and vendors had pointed out that the fish sold in markets had been brought in from outside the State. According to a quick survey undertaken, through MMKS, women vendors suffered losses of \*USD 368.12 to 552.16 each as they were unable to sell the fish they held in stock. Vendors are, however, yet to be compensated for their massive losses.

There are 61 fish markets under the BMC, said Patil, through which about 15,000 women sell fish. This number does not include women who sell fish on streets or door-to-door. Women have found it an uphill task to get licences to sell in formal markets, and many are yet to get licences. In markets that are being re-developed under a public-private-partnership (PPP) model, many of the vendors, particularly those

without licences, have been displaced and evicted from their traditional spaces. In other markets managed by BMC, sanitation and facilities are very poor. It is not clear how funds allocated for repair and maintenance of markets have been used. The need to support the livelihoods of women vendors through organizing them is critical, Patil concluded.

## Presentation of study on women fish vendors in Mumbai

Shuddhawati Peke, Researcher, ICSF, presented the findings of her study on women fish vendors, which dealt with the challenges faced by fisherfolk in highly urbanized Mumbai and their struggle to protect their spaces. Her presentation highlighted the problems of women vendors in formal markets (BMC-owned and private markets), in street markets and in door-todoor sales. In formal markets, such as Dhobi Talao and Marol, women vendors face problems related to nonissue of licences to legitimate vendors, poor maintenance of markets and inadequate facilities. In street markets, in addition to the lack of infrastructure and facilities, there is also the threat of eviction by government bodies. Peripatetic vendors were especially concerned with access to customers as gated communities often bar entry of hawkers. Moreover, there are BMC rules that prohibit sale of perishable commodities outside markets.

Peke's presentation drew attention to proposals that had been received during the course of the study. Vendors operating in formal markets, for example. had advocated the redevelopment of markets using government funding, such as funds available through the National Fisheries Development Board (NFDB) or through self-development. Vendors came out strongly against the PPP model for market redevelopment. They also highlighted the need to improve basic facilities at formal markets, harbours and landing centres. Other proposals related to the need to ensure access to fish and social-security measures. Peke's presentation ended with an overview of the existing organizations representing fish vendors in Mumbai and their activities.

### Presentation by YUVA

In his presentation, Raju Bhise of YUVA highlighted the need fishing communities in Mumbai to be recognized as indigenous; the interests and customary rights of such special groups should be non-negotiable, he added. It is important to ensure proper recognition of their housing and livelihood spaces, in view of the conflicts over space associated with the increasing urbanization of Mumbai. Bhise drew attention to the Mumbai development plan that is currently being prepared for the development of the city over the next 20 years. The first stage of the plan, which is ongoing, is to map existing land use. At this stage, it is important for community fishing organizations to ensure that their housing and including livelihood spaces, vending and processing spaces, are reflected in the mapping process.

In the second stage, concrete proposals about land use will be invited and consolidated. It will be important for fishing community organizations to present proposals to, for example, demarcate land for markets (street markets and formal markets), playgrounds in *koliwada*s or community centres. Given the rapidly expanding populations and the municipal limits of the city, it may be important to propose fish markets in newly developing areas of Mumbai.

Once this stage is over, the draft plan will be made available and a

public hearing will be held to discuss it. It will be important that fishing community organizations participate in these hearings and draw attention to demands that have not been incorporated in the plan. They will need to keep up a dialogue with the BMC. At the final stage, the plan will be discussed within BMC's general body, where elected members will discuss and approve the plan. The fishing community in Mumbai will need to be alert throughout the entire process and maintain pressure on their elected representatives to ensure that their demands are met, said Bhise. Once the plan has been finalized, it will be difficult to seek any change.

It is imperative to keep in mind, Bhise added, that the Mumbai Metropolitan Region Development Authority (MMRDA) is responsible for the planning of large development projects in coastal areas. It is vital to keep track of upcoming projects and intervene early—at the planning stage—to ensure that the interests of fishing communities are protected. Other development projects, such as projects undertaken by the Slum Redevelopment Authority (SRA) in coastal areas, also need to be tracked, as they too have implications for fishing community livelihoods. With regard to redevelopment of markets under the PPP model, as extra spaces are created based on the floor space index (FSI) applicable, vendor associations need to stake their claims to the spaces created, Bhise said.

## Sharing by members of the National Hawkers' Federation

In the post-lunch session, members of the NHF from Odisha, Chhattisgarh, Jharkhand and West Bengal shared their experiences of working with street vendors and hawkers in their States. Pratap Sahu from Odisha spoke of their work with vendors in Bhubaneshwar, where vending zones have been demarcated along roadsides. These are square or rectangular spaces, between six to eight sq ft in area, where basic facilities, including kiosks, toilets and drinking water dispensers, are provided by the municipality and where vendors in the area are accommodated. A vending area for about 40 women selling fish has also been demarcated. There are currently 56 vending zones in Bhubaneshwar, each with its own Town Vending Committee (TVC).

Responding to a query on how these zones are selected, Sahu said that the union undertakes a survey in various localities to identify potential areas to locate the zones, and this information is then provided the municipality authorities. Once the municipality cross-checks the information and approves the vending zone, it is set aside to accommodate the hawkers in the locality. The municipality tracks usage and, based on that monitoring, provides vendors with licences, renewable on an annual basis. A proper shelter is subsequently provided, on a costsharing basis. Pointing out that hawkers should be seen as a boon and not a menace, Sahu said that if hawkers are accommodated in city planning, many urban planning and social objectives can be achieved, including rehabilitation of hawkers. cleaner public spaces, cheaper goods for tourists, and an income for marginal workers.

Anita Das, an NHF member from Jharkhand, shared her experience of organizing street vendors. The organization evolved because women vendors in Ranchi and other cities were being evicted by builders. The organization has since worked on several issues, including organizing shelter for street vendors, and

advocating for a vendor policy for the State. Jharkhand is one of the few States that have legislation for street vendors. TVCs, in which women represent one-third of membership, have started functioning in several markets and social-security schemes for vendors, such as health insurance and old-age pension, are now a reality.

Hussain from Abdul Dhaka, Bangladesh, said that while there is a hawkers association in the city, fisherwomen are not members as it is mainly men who sell fish there. Shaktiman Ghosh from West Bengal, speaking at the end of the session, stressed the importance of implementing the National Street Vendors Policy of 2009. India has 40 around mn hawkers who contribute to the economy and provide goods to 77 per cent of the population, earning about USD 0.37 daily. Hawkers are essential for catering to customers who cannot afford to shop in malls, he said.

## Sharing by organizations representing vendor associations in Mumbai

Suresh Bhoir of MMKS spoke of the organization's survey of women fish vendors, which sought to find out whether they would consider selling fish in different levels of large shopping malls. All the respondents said they would prefer to sell fish at the ground level of malls, adding that fish stalls should be located near the entrances to the malls. MMKS has worked to develop a model plan a fish market, taking into consideration the space needed for storing fish, water, ice, and so on. Each vendor needs at least five sq ft of space, besides a platform of at least three feet in height for vending, under which there should be adequate provision for storage of fish. Issues related to sanitation, water and disposal of waste fish (or conversion

into fishmeal) also need to be addressed.

Bhoir drew attention to the organizational problems besetting vendor associations in fish markets. Some leaders work for their own interests, he said. For example, in several markets that are beina redeveloped under the PPP model, women vendors have been asked by association leaders to sign consent letters, though they have no idea what they are consenting to. Bhoir said the problem is compounded by the fact that BMC's new market policy (with details of the PPP scheme) is not yet publicly available.

Bhoir also pointed out that the number of markets for the fast-growing suburbs is inadequate. According to BMC rules for every 1,000 persons, 0.06 ha has to be set aside for a market. BMC has informed MMKS that seven new markets are being planned, and that MMKS will be consulted regarding these. MMKS has also suggested to BMC that efforts should be made to accommodate street and door-to-door vendors in new markets.

Sharing her experiences, Purnima Mehar of MMKS stressed the need for women to be better organized—only then will they be able to exert greater political pressure to protect their interests.

Mahesh Worlikar and Vedant Katkar from the Worli koliwada shared their views. Worlikar said he has been working with fisherwomen since 2005, helping them obtain vending licences, seeking establishment of more markets, and supporting their agitation against the bhaiyas (local slang for men from the north of the country who are also engaged in selling fish). He also highlighted the need for new markets in the suburbs, where customers prefer to buy fish from market stalls and not from street vendors. Katkar spoke

about efforts currently underway to ensure that the rights of fishing communities are recognized and protected in the development plan process.

Nalini Nayak, Member, ICSF pointed out fishing communities in Mumbai, unlike those in other parts of India, have a strong case as their customary rights, for example to common areas for drying fish, are recognized. Fishing communities in Mumbai must use this recognition to their greater advantage, she stressed.

Jyoti Mehar of Maharashtra Rajya Macchimar Sahakari Sangha shared how women fish vendors in Shivaji Mandai, a wholesale market, lost their vending spaces to private traders, and the role played by the BMC in this process.

Usha Tamore, Secretary of the Mumbai Zilha Matsya Vikreta Mahila Sahakari Society Limited shared her personal experience as a fish vendor. She described how traders regularly tamper with the weighing scales, depriving vendors of their rightful share of fish. To avoid being cheated, some vendors even carry their own weighing machines, which is is not an easy task. Tamore also expressed concern over the entry of non-traditional people, such as the *bhaiyas*, into the fish vending profession.

Pankaj Bhave, a member of the fishing community and a member of the Central Food Processing Board. said that efforts need to be undertaken to make fish vending an economically viable business. Responding to the problem raised by women fish vendors regarding migrants from other States taking over their spaces, Bhave said that instead of blaming the migrants for muscling in on what fisherwomen's traditionally business, it is important to learn from them. The migrants work in groups to buy fish, thus reducing costs, and are thus more competitive. Bhave

suggested that the women should consider doing the same. Bhave also suggested that the women fish vendors investigate the possibility of selling value-added fish products along with their traditional merchandise of dry and fresh fish. Opportunities such as creating fish vending kiosks on beaches and other tourist locations should be explored, with members of fishing communities being given priority for setting up such stalls. The value of fish as an excellent source of nutrition should be better highlighted, he said.

Bhave highlighted problems in existing markets such as the lack of parking space unlike in the malls. There is need to address such issues so as to attract customers. Another problem, he said, is that though Maharashtra has a large network of co-operatives, they are not willing to market fish locally, though the fish would fetch good prices. They prefer to sell to exporters directly. Bhave also rued the fact that there is no wholesale market catering to suburban areas, forcing women vendors from the districts to travel to central Mumbai to buy fish. To make things worse, all subsidies and funds are provided to co-operatives and not to the women who market and process fish.

## Proposals for supporting livelihoods of fish vendors

In the final session, Nalini Nayak and Chandrika Sharma of ICSF sought to consolidate the proposals that had been made so that they could be shared with the officials and other participants attending the workshop on the following day. The following proposals were finalized:

## (A) Existing structured markets (retail and wholesale)

1. Facilities at existing

## markets (retail and wholesale)

- Facilities at existing markets (for water, sanitation, waste disposal) need to be revamped.
- Seating and fish storage facilities need to be improved.
- Fish stalls should be located at the front of markets (for better visibility.
- Tampering with the weighing of fish in wholesale markets needs to be controlled.

## 2. Redevelopment of existing markets (retail and wholesale)

- Existing vendors should be involved in the redevelopment process at all stages.
- All redevelopment should be funded by government agencies like BMC/NFDB. (The PPP model should be avoided.)
- Vertical development of markets, with different floors for different fish product categories, could be considered, with the ground floor set aside for fresh fish.

#### 3. Licences

- Licences should be provided to all legitimate vendors through a transparent process.
- Licences should be transferable within families so that future generations can continue in the trade.

## (B) Fish procurement areas/ landing centres (Sassoon Dock and Ferry Wharf)

- The problems faced by women fish vendors at these locations need to be addressed.
- Infrastructure needs to be improved urgently, with a special focus on hygiene and sanitary conditions.
- Vendors should be provided storage facilities.

- Women should be ensured access to auction halls.
- Night shelters should be provided where needed.

## (C) Development of new markets

#### Retail

- New fish markets, particularly in suburban Mumbai, should be developed.
- Such markets should be clearly provided for in the Development Plan.
- The fishing community/women vendors should be an integral part of the process of developing these markets.
- Smaller kiosks/fish food courts should be developed near koliwadas and in tourist spots like beaches and railway stations.

#### Wholesale

- A new wholesale fish market is essential.
- This should be easily accessible by vehicles, and conveniently located, for instance, near train stations.
- Bhaindar, Andheri and Mahim are the preferred locations.
- The market should be clearly provided for in the Development Plan.
- The fishing community/women vendors should be integrated into the process of developing such a market.

#### (D) Street vending

- A street vendor policy should be notified for Maharashtra.
- TVCs should be created with a good representation of women fish vendors.
- Fish vendors selling on the street should be provided with identity cards so as to be recognized as fishworkers.
- With reference to Section 410 of the BMC Act, women fish vendors

should be provided training in hygienic handling of fish, and supported to continue vending.

## (E) Mumbai Development Plan

There is a need to engage with, and influence, the development plan, especially to:

- highlight existing unstructured markets in the ongoing mapping exercise;
- propose new wholesale and retail fish markets for inclusion in the development plan;
- highlight possibilities of new markets close to existing koliwadas; and
- develop these markets in ways that can also attract tourists and highlight the way of life of the koli community.

## (F) Capacity building, organization and training for women vendors

- Marketing co-operatives/selfhelp groups (SHGs) of women fish vendors should be facilitated and supported.
- Training should be provided to fisherwomen on organizational skills, value addition, hygienic handling of fish, financial management and so on.

### (G) Social security

- Fisherwomen should have ensured access to programmes such as savings-cum-relief schemes for income during lean periods.
- They should be provided with insurance and pension, and housing support for single women.
- Compensations for lost livelihood opportunities (such as happens during oil spills) should be ensured.

# Report of the Workshop Day 2: 3 December 2012

he focus of the second day the workshop was on facilitation dialogue fish between representatives of vendor associations, officials from department, BMC, the fisheries researchers and activists on issues affecting the livelihood of women fish vendors in Mumbai as well as discussions on proposals that had been compiled the previous Participants included representatives **BMC** and the fisheries department, professors and research scholars from TISS and the Central Institute of Fisheries Education (CIFE), representatives of fishworker and fish vendor associations and activists.

#### Introduction

The day started with participants introducing themselves. Chandrika Sharma of ICSF made a brief presentation about women in fisheries in India, their socioeconomic status and their important role in marketing and processing. She also gave an overview of the previous day's discussions.

## Sharing by Macanzy Dabre, YUVA

Macanzy Dabre spoke about the situation of street vendors in Mumbai, the constant harassment and threat of eviction faced by them and the need to implement the National Street Vendors Policy, 2009. A debate followed on vendors whose domicile in Maharashtra is recent (as compared to women fish vendors who have traditionally marketed fish). Under the Indian Constitution, citizens have the right to work anywhere in the country, said

Dabre. He also pointed out that the 2009 policy has gone back on certain important provisions of the 2004 policy, such as the need for vendor participation in city planning, reservation of spaces for vending (which earlier used to be two per cent of urban areas) and introduction of restrictions on vending in specific areas like schools and religious places.

## Presentation of study on women fish vendors in Mumbai

Shuddhawati Peke, Researcher, ICSF, presented her study titled "Women Fish Vendors in Mumbai" and the proposals that had emerged from it. She emphasized the current situation in BMC markets, characterized by poor facilities and sanitation, and the vulnerable situation of street vendors who are considered illegal by BMC. Peke also pointed out the absence of central and State schemes for women fish vendors. She highlighted the lack of authentic statistical or qualitative data on women in fisheries in Maharashtra. On a query regarding the health and nutritional status of fisherwomen, Arpita Sharma of CIFE informed the workshop that CIFE had recently initiated a study on this issue in Versova, Mumbai.

### Response to proposals

In the post-lunch session, the proposals to protect the livelihood of women fish vendors in Mumbai, finalized the previous day, were presented and participants were asked to comment on them. Head Inspector S S Geete and Market Inspector D K Rathod

12

of BMC said that they were not in a position to comment on the issue of redevelopment of markets but that they would communicate discussions of the workshop and particularly the concerns of the women fish vendors to relevant officials. The policy, they said, should be available online. They also pointed out that some markets, including private markets, already existed in the suburbs.

Regarding the condition of existing markets, they said most markets have been repaired and are being maintained and that the overall situation had improved. In some cases, repairs may not have been undertaken if the market was slated for redevelopment. They also pointed the hygiene-related challenges posed by a commodity such as fish, problems that are compounded if conservancy workers are absent for even a day. They, however, took note of the problems that women fish vendors had identified in some markets such as those related to water, seating, drainage and sanitation. They suggested that women vendors should make known their complaints to higher authorities and should meet with BMC officials with their proposals.

Yuvrai Chougule, **Assistant** Commissioner, Department of Fisheries, pointed out that there is no strong organization representing fisherwomen in Mumbai. For instance, different organizations (all representing fisherwomen) have provided different lists of vendors to whom compensation for the oil spill is due. Similar problems are faced regarding provision of identity cards. The fisheries department, he said, has not received an application seeking social-security coverage for fisherwomen. Is it not the responsibility of the fisheries department to implement schemes put forward by the central government, asked Nalini Nayak of ICSF. In Kerala, for example, it is the fisheries department that takes the lead on such matters. Chougule invited the women's organizations to meet the fisheries department with their demands. The department, he said, will try its best to respond.

Chougule said that NFDB is funding the redevelopment of around 23 markets in the State. He urged BMC to take forward proposals for market redevelopment using funds available through NFDB. Usha Tamore raised the issue of Pikale market, a private market which is being redeveloped. Women vendors are being displaced to the streets. She stressed that redevelopment should not result in vendors losing control of markets. Redevelopment should be through government funding such through NFDB. Women should be given the opportunity to design the market, using the extra floor space generated to sell other value-added products.

Avinash Nakhava, Assistant Commissioner, Department of Fisheries, said that efforts are under way to improve the harbours at Cuffe Parade and Sasson Dock, for which a budget of USD 183,694.91 has been allotted. The harbours, he clarified, are under the Bombay Port Trust Authority. He suggested that women's groups meet the concerned officials in the Port Trust to present their case and seek appropriate facilities.

Sheela Immanuel of CIFE, stressing the need to support women fish vendors in Mumbai, highlighted the areas in which CIFE could contribute. CIFE could help increase awareness about schemes available for fish vendors, impart training on hygienic fish handling, raise awareness on health and nutritional aspects, organize free health camps, and undertake research and documentation, among other tasks.

A Rambabu of TISS said that a research project on access to social-security schemes and the drawbacks of the implementation process could be undertaken. Referring to the M-ward project (an inclusive urban development initiative which is peoplecentric and people-led) under way in TISS, Nalini Nayak of ICSF suggested that it would be useful if the project staff could work with, and assist, fishworker organizations in the area to make appropriate suggestions for inclusion in the Development Plan.

Saurav Roy from Teach for India (a nationwide movement of college graduates and young professionals working towards eliminating educational inequity in India) said that the concerns raised in this workshop were valid. Citing the example of Moragav, where he works on

livelihood projects for fisherwomen, he said that the main problem is lack of information. There is need to support processes for documentation and strategic planning, as well as train women leaders for effective leadership roles. Roy elaborated on his project to prepare and market value-added food from waste fish. Nalini Nayak of ICSF said that it is important to undertake a cost-benefit analysis of such projects, and take them up only after due diligence, so that both raw material supply and market access are factored in.

The workshop concluded with an unequivocal expression of commitment and support for protecting women's spaces in fish markets and in fisheries in general. Chandrika Sharma of ICSF wound up the proceedings with a vote of thanks.

## **Appendix 1**

## Workshop to discuss the study on women fish vendors in Mumbai

## 2 December 2012

## **Programme**

Day 1	Sunday, 02 December 2012
1000 – 1020 hrs	Welcome and Introduction Chandrika Sharma, Executive Secretary, ICSF
1020 – 1040 hrs	Problems faced by fish vendors in Mumbai: An overview Ujjwala Patil, MMKS
1040 - 1100 hrs	Tea
1100 – 1200 hrs	Presentation of study on women fish vendors in Mumbai Shuddhawati Peke, Researcher, ICSF
1200 – 1300 hrs	Sharing of experiences by vendor associations
1300 – 1400 hrs	Lunch
1400 – 1500 hrs	Sharing of experiences by representatives of hawker unions from other States
1500 – 1520 hrs	Tea
1520 – 1730 hrs	Discussion: Finalizing proposals and strategies for defending the livelihoods of women fish vendors in Mumbai
Day 2	Monday, 03 December 2012
<b>Day 2</b> 1000 – 1020 hrs	Monday, 03 December 2012  Welcome and Introduction Chandrika Sharma, Executive Secretary, ICSF
	Welcome and Introduction
1000 – 1020 hrs	Welcome and Introduction Chandrika Sharma, Executive Secretary, ICSF
1000 – 1020 hrs 1020 – 1040 hrs	Welcome and Introduction Chandrika Sharma, Executive Secretary, ICSF Problems faced by fish vendors in Mumbai: An overview Ujjwala Patil, MMKS
1000 – 1020 hrs 1020 – 1040 hrs 1040 – 1100 hrs	Welcome and Introduction Chandrika Sharma, Executive Secretary, ICSF Problems faced by fish vendors in Mumbai: An overview Ujjwala Patil, MMKS Tea Presentation of study on women fish vendors in Mumbai
1000 – 1020 hrs 1020 – 1040 hrs 1040 – 1100 hrs 1100 – 1200 hrs	Welcome and Introduction Chandrika Sharma, Executive Secretary, ICSF Problems faced by fish vendors in Mumbai: An overview Ujjwala Patil, MMKS Tea Presentation of study on women fish vendors in Mumbai Shuddhawati Peke, Researcher, ICSF Presentation of proposals for defending the livelihoods of women fish vendors
1000 – 1020 hrs 1020 – 1040 hrs 1040 – 1100 hrs 1100 – 1200 hrs	Welcome and Introduction Chandrika Sharma, Executive Secretary, ICSF Problems faced by fish vendors in Mumbai: An overview Ujjwala Patil, MMKS Tea Presentation of study on women fish vendors in Mumbai Shuddhawati Peke, Researcher, ICSF Presentation of proposals for defending the livelihoods of women fish vendors in Mumbai
1000 – 1020 hrs 1020 – 1040 hrs 1040 – 1100 hrs 1100 – 1200 hrs 1200 – 1300 hrs	Welcome and Introduction Chandrika Sharma, Executive Secretary, ICSF Problems faced by fish vendors in Mumbai: An overview Ujjwala Patil, MMKS Tea Presentation of study on women fish vendors in Mumbai Shuddhawati Peke, Researcher, ICSF Presentation of proposals for defending the livelihoods of women fish vendors in Mumbai Discussion on experiences and strategies to be adopted in each State
1000 – 1020 hrs 1020 – 1040 hrs 1040 – 1100 hrs 1100 – 1200 hrs 1200 – 1300 hrs	Welcome and Introduction Chandrika Sharma, Executive Secretary, ICSF Problems faced by fish vendors in Mumbai: An overview Ujjwala Patil, MMKS Tea Presentation of study on women fish vendors in Mumbai Shuddhawati Peke, Researcher, ICSF Presentation of proposals for defending the livelihoods of women fish vendors in Mumbai Discussion on experiences and strategies to be adopted in each State Lunch Responses and proposals from participants and invitees: Department of

## **Appendix 2**

### **List of Participants**

### **Fishworker Organizations**

 Jyoti Mehar Maharashtra Rajya Macchimar Sahakari Sangha Kharibav, Samrat Mitra Mandal At Post Satpati, Tal Palghar Dt. Thane 401 405 MAHARASHTRA

Cell: 91 9922769210

 Kanta Prakash Gholup Women Vendor, Jijamata Mandai Room no 126, Yadav Tea House Dinbandhu Nagar, Salt Pan Road Wadala, Mumbai 400 037 MAHARASHTRA

Cell: 91 9221260089

Mahadev K. Koli
 Turbhe Machhimar Co- operative
 Society
 Arjun Villa, Near Chereshwar Mandir
 Trombay Koliwada
 Mumbai 400 018
 MAHARASHTRA

Cell: 91 9702820991

Email: mskoli100@gmail.com

Mahesh Worlikar
 Worli Koliwada
 307, Worli Koli Samaj Bhavan
 Opposite Mehta Manohar Building
 Worli Koliwada, Mumbai 400 030
 MAHARASHTRA

Email: mahesh.worlikar@gamil.com

 Pankaj Motiram Bhave Maharashtra Macchimar Kruti Samittee Niraakar A/102, Kalyan Complex, Panch Marg Yari Road, Versova, Andheri (West) Mumbai 400 061 MAHARASHTRA

> Cell: 91 9819200397 Email: pankajbhave@ymail.com

6. Purnima M. Meher National Fishworkers' Forum at Wadarai Village, Post K. Mahim Palaghar, Dt.Thane 401 404 MAHARASHTRA

> Tel: 91 2525 628036 Cell: 91 9892838203

Email: purnima.meher@yahoo.com

 Rajesh Jagan Mangela Maharashtra Macchimar Kruti Samitee House no 191, Mangela wadi J. R. M. Road, Juhu Moragaon Mumbai 400 049 MAHARASHTRA

Cell: 91 9869019325 Email: rajeshmangela26@gmail.com

Rekha T. Keni
 Maharashtra Macchimar Kruti
 Samittee
 Room no 24, First Floor

Mrudungacharya Koli Cooperative Society

Mahim, Mumbai 400 016 MAHARASHTRA

Cell: 91 7738207789

R. K. Patil
 National Fishworkers' Forum
 c/o Prashant R. Patil
 5, First Floor, Chandramani Villa
 Natvar Nagar, Street No 2
 Jogeshwari (East)
 Mumbai 400 060
 MAHARASHTRA

Cell: 91 9892833815

Email: patil.rambhau@gmail.com

10. Surekha Ganesh Naik Mahim Koliwada Room no 208, Second Floor, B Wing Sagar Samrat, Machhimar Nagar Behind Vivekanand Garden Mahim, Mumbai 400 016 MAHARASHTRA

> Cell: 91 9867501399 Email: sur.naik11@gmail.com

 Suresh Shinwar Bhoir Maharashtra Macchimar Kruti Samittee Building number 16 A/ Room No 616 Fourth Floor, Fishermen Colony, Mahim Mumbai 400 016 MAHARASHTRA

> Cell: 91 9322112729 91 9146417145

12. Ujjwala J Patil

National Fishworkers' Forum C/410 Sagar Samrat Macchimar Nagar Behind Vivekanand Garden Mahim, Mumbai 400 016 MAHARASHTRA

Cell: 91 9867111543

Email: ujwala.j.patil@gmail.com

13. Usha Tamore

Mumbai District Matsya Vikreta Mahila Sahakari Society Ltd. Room No. 268 1/2, Plot no 17 Prajasevak Society, Behind Andhra Bank Mori road, Mahim Mumbai 400 016 MAHARASHTRA

Cell: 91 9869123873 91 9029220683

Email: ushatamore@gmail.com

14. Vedant Katkar Worli Koliwada

307, Worli Koli Samaj Bhavan Opposite Mehta Manohar Building Worli Koliwada, Mumbai 400 030 MAHARASHTRA

Cell: 91 9819783977

Email: vedant\_katkar@rediffmail.com

#### National Hawkers Federation

15. Abdul Hussain (Bangladesh) National Hawkers Federation 16/17 College Street Kolkata 700 012 WEST BENGAL

Cell: 880 1742201248

16. Anita Das

General Secretary, Ranchi Footpath Dukandar Hawkers Sangha National Hawkers Federation 16/17 College Street Kolkata 700 012 WEST BENGAL

Cell: 91 9339762931

Email: sweetanitadas@gmail.com

17. Arun Kumar Khuntia

Sambalpur Vendor's Cooperative Society

Post Modipura, near LIC Colony Dt. Sambalpur 768 002

**ODISHA** 

Cell: 91 9438382612

18. Biswendu Nanda Kalaboti mudra

24/18, Nabalia Para Road, Barisha

Kolkata 700 008 WEST BENGAL

Cell: 91 9163825994

Email: biswendu@yahoo.com

19. Jayanta Das

President, Nikhila Odisha Small and Street Vendors Union Proof Road, Padhuanpada Dt. Balasore 756 001 ODISHA

Cell: 91 9437060009

Email: jayantadassocioeconomy@

gmail.com

20. Madhu Mangal Malakar

Bongiro Paramparik Karu o Bastro Shilti Sangha Village Muskipur P.O. Baragram Dt. Dakshin Dinajpur 733 128 WEST BENGAL

Tel: 91 3523 271267

21. Pratap Sahu

All Odisha Roadside Vendors Association

C/o ALGM, Plot no 212, Shastri Nagar, Unit 4 Bhubaneswar 751 001

**ODISHA** 

Cell: 91 9438182775 91 9861122936

Email: pratap\_k\_sahu@sify.com

22. Shaktiman Ghosh

General Secretary, National Hawkers

Federation

16/17 College Street Kolkata 700 012

WEST BENGAL

Cell: 91 9748585961

Email: nationalhawkerfederation@

amail.com

#### Government

23. Avinash Nakhava

Assistant Commissioner of Fisheries (Mumbai Suburbun) Administrative Building, Seventh Floor Near Chetna College, Bandra (East)

Mumbai 400 051 MAHARASHTRA

Tel: 91 22 26551996

Email: avinakhawa12@gmail.com

24. DK Rathod

Market Inspector, Brihanmumbai Municipal Corporation Mahatma Jyotiba Phule Market Building

First floor, Dr. D.N. Road, Fort

Mumbai 400 001

MAHARASHTRA

25. Gajanan L. Bundele Licensing Officer, New Ferry Wharf Fisheries Department, Government of Maharashtra Administrative Building, Seventh Floor Near Chetna College, Bandra (East) Mumbai 400 051 MAHARASHTRA

Tel: 91 22 26551996

26. Sandesh Geete Head Inspector (Market), Brihanmumbai Municipal Corporation Mahatma Jyotiba Phule Market Building First floor, Dr. D.N. Road, Fort Mumbai 400 001 MAHARASHTRA

Yuvraj Chougule
 Assistant Commissioner of Fisheries
 (Mumbai City)
 Administrative Building, Seventh Floor
 Near Chetna College, Bandra (East)
 Mumbai 400 051
 MAHARASHTRA

Tel: 91 22 26551996

#### **Research Institutions**

28. A Rambabu

Assistant Professor, Centre for Study of Social Exclusion and Inclusive Policies Tata Institute of Social Sciences V.N. Purav Marg, Deonar Mumbai 400 088 MAHARASHTRA

Tel: 91 22 25525000 Extn (5357) Email: rambabu\_arb@ yahoo.com

29. Arpita Sharma

Senior Scientist, Central Institute of Fisheries Education Fisheries University Road, Seven Bungalows, Versova Mumbai 400 061 MAHARASHTRA

Tel: 9122 26361446 Cell: 91 9820645165 Fax. 9122 26361573

Email: arpita\_sharma@yahoo.com

Bhagyashree Mundhe
 Research Scholar, Tata Institute of
 Social Sciences
 Room no 604, Hostel no 4
 Tata Institute of Social Sciences
 V.N. Purav Marg, Deonar
 Mumbai 400 088
 MAHARASHTRA

Cell: 91 9595263728

Email: bhagyashri\_mundhe@yahoo.in

31. Dinesh Chand
Program Officer
M ward Project Office,
Fifth floor, Library Building,
Tata Institute of Social Sciences,
V.N. Purav Marg, Deonar
Mumbai 400 088
MAHARASHTRA

Cell: 91 9699757001

Email: dineshchand030@gmail.com

32. Geetanjoy Sahu
Assistant Professor,
Centre for Climate Change
and Sustainability Studies
School of Habitat Studies,
Tata Institute of Social Sciences
V.N. Purav Marg, Deonar
Mumbai 400 088
MAHARASHTRA

Tel: 91 22 25525000 Extn 5377

Cell: 91 9619584969

Email: geetanjoy.sahu@gmail.com, geetanjoy@tiss.edu

33. Ilina Sen

Associate Professor, Advanced Centre for Women's Studies School of Development Studies, Tata Institute of Social Sciences V.N. Purav Marg, Deonar Mumbai 400 088 MAHARASHTRA

Tel: 91 22 25525000 Extn 5364 Cell: 91 9960218104 Email: sen.ilina@gmail.com

34. Nandita Mondal
Research Scholar,
Tata Institute of Social Sciences
C/o Mr. Parthsarathi Mondal
Room No 9, Building No.1
Academic Staff Quarters
Tata Institute of Social Sciences
V.N.Purav Marg, Deonar
Mumbai 400 088

Cell: 91 9869087934

MAHARASHTRA

Email: nandita\_mondal@hotmail.com

35. Sheela Immanuel
Senior Scientist,
Central Institute of Fisheries Education
Fisheries University Road,
Seven Bungalows, Versova
Mumbai 400 061
MAHARASHTRA

Email: sheelaimmanuel@cife.edu.in

#### NGOs

Macanzy Dabre
 YUVA India
 Sector 7, Plot no 2, Kharghar
 Navi Mumbai 410 210
 MAHARASHTRA

Tel: 91 22 27740999/90 Cell: 91 9270020758

Email: macdabre@gmail.com

37. Rajendra Bhise

Youth for Unity and Action (YUVA) Room No. 5 & 6, New Naigaon Municipal School Opp. Saraswati Vidyalaya, Dr. Ambedkar Road, Naigaon, Dadar (E), Mumbai 400 014 MAHARASHTRA

Tel.: 91 22 24116393/94 Cell: 91 9960464430

Email: raju.bhise@yuvaindia.org

38. Saurav Ghosh Roy

Senior Fellow, Teach for India c/o Godrej Industries Complex Gate No.2, Pirojshanagar Eastern Express Highway Vikhroli (East) Mumbai 400 079 MAHARASHTRA

Tel: 91 22 25185821 Cell: 91 9892648078

Email: saurav.roy2011@teachforindia.

org

### **ICSF Members**

Nalini Nayak
 Sadanand, ANRA 62
 Choola Lane, Anayara PO
 Trivandrum 695 029
 KERALA

Tel: 91 471 2460081

Email: nalini.nayak@gmail.com

#### **ICSF Secretariat**

40. Chandrika Sharma No 27, College Road Chennai 600 006 TAMIL NADU

> Tel: 91 44 28223630 Email: icsf@icsf.net

41. Shuddhawati Peke No 27, College Road Chennai 600 006 TAMIL NADU

> Tel: 91 44 28223630 Email: icsf@icsf.net

#### **Others**

42. Heena Sayyed Akhtar D Sector, opposite z Lane, Near Star School Room no 346, Cheetah Camp Trombay, Mumbai 400 088 MAHARASHTRA

Cell: 91 8108313125

Email: sayyed.heena824@gmail.com